

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, October 21, 2015 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS: PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*

BARRY WINICK, Vice-Chair

MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS

CRAIG SHALLANBERGER JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW
CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor

NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian JOANNA KAUFMAN, Planning Technician AMBER FLEMMINGS, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie, Mahan, Murray, Orías, Shallanberger (until 5:30 p.m.), Suding, and

Veyna

Members absent: Winick

Staff present: Limón, Hernández, Kaufman, and Jennifer Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of

October 7, 2015, with corrections.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 5/0/3. (La Voie, Murray, and Shallanberger abstained/Winick absent.)

Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan and Julio Veyna; Item E

reviewed by William La Voie.

Action: Veyna/Drury, 6/0/2. (Murray abstained (Item C); Mahan abstained (Item E)/Winick

absent.) Motion carried.

Commissioner Murray read a letter of concern regarding Item I from Mary Louise Days.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

Ms. Kaufman announced that Commissioner Winick will be absent.

- E. Subcommittee Reports.
 - 1. Commissioner Mahan reported on the Mixed Use and Multi-Unit Guidelines meeting. He stated that staff recommended and the subcommittee agreed that a consultant would be hired to expedite the guideline formulation process.

Commissioner Orías mentioned that she had volunteered to serve as an alternate representative for the HLC at this meeting and asked why she had not been notified about it.

Mr. Limón replied that in order to expedite the meeting process, and because the intent of the subcommittee is to assist the Architectural Board of Review in forming guidelines that are mostly within its purview, only one HLC member is needed. The next step is to prepare an update on the work of the subcommittee so that the HLC is kept informed. Chair Suding and Commissioner Orías requested that Commissioner Orías be kept apprised of meeting information, and Mr. Limón agreed.

2. Commissioner Drury announced that he attended the Joint City Council and Planning Commission meeting on October 8 to represent the HLC regarding the AUD project at 800 Santa Barbara Street.

At the meeting, the applicant presented new plans; though Commissioner Drury could not comment on them, he did state that he stood by the HLC motion of the previous presentation. The Planning Commission called the new presentation "a mess" and "confusing." The applicant replied that HLC motions are often confusing. Generally, the Planning Commission directed that the HLC and the applicant resolve the issues.

Commissioner Drury opined that the HLC's motion was clear. He announced to the public that the HLC can clarify any motion at the time it is made. Chair Suding emphasized that the HLC strives to keep motions succinct and direct.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

1. 1200 BLK OUINIENTOS ST 1373 SEG ID

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-373

Application Number: MST2014-00387
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Landscape Architect: David Black & Associates

(Proposal to replace the Quinientos Street Bridge over Sycamore Creek. The existing single span bridge is approximately 36 feet long and 38 feet wide and was constructed in 1930. A new single span concrete bridge will be designed to meet the required standards of the City, Caltrans, and the American Association of State Highway and Transportation officials [AASHTO].)

(Review of a Historic Resources Evaluation Report and Memorandum prepared by Applied Earthworks, Inc. The report concludes that the following residences have historical significance: 510, 517, 523, 524, 525, & 528 Casitas Rd.; 1211, 1217, & 1255 E. Cota St.)

Actual time: 1:46 p.m.

Present: Colleen Hamilton, Senior Architectural Historian, Applied Earthworks; and Tom Conti,

Design Engineer, Applied Earthworks

<u>Staff comments</u>: Ms. Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that staff agrees with the conclusions of the report that the project meets the Secretary of Interior's Standards and CEQA guidelines.

Public comment opened at 1:46 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Public comment re-opened at 1:57 p.m.

1. Leslie Colasse, owner of 1215 E. Cota Street, spoke of her concern about her house being on the proposed list of historic structures. Her house is going through a major addition and remodel, and she was taken aback by the notification that its historical significance was being investigated. She questioned the notification process and recommended a cover letter from the City with better explanation of what is happening.

Ms. Hernández replied that this was a windshield survey of potential historic significance in the neighborhood, and that it is appropriate to notify owners that their homes might have historic significance, as such a finding would start the process of being added to the City's Potential Historic Resources List. She emphasized that these buildings have not been thoroughly researched and that the report was only a first analysis of significant style and authenticity. She also clarified that 1215 E. Cota Street is not included in the list of homes found to have historical significance in the Historic Resources Evaluation Report.

2. Carol Fletcher, owner of 1211 E. Cota Street, had a similar concern and explained several modifications to her home. She stated that it was disconcerting to get the notice and that she wanted to know the ramifications of her home being found historically significant. She feared that it would prevent or add significant cost to any modifications and would therefore diminish the value of her property.

Chair Suding explained that her property has not been exhaustively researched for historical significance. He also explained that a historic designation does not disallow future modifications.

Ms. Hernández stated that before Ms. Fletcher's property moved any further in the process, it would be more thoroughly researched, but as a general explanation, once evidence of historic significance is noted in these reports, the City tries to protect it. She emphasized that this report represents only a preliminary evaluation.

Commissioner Murray clarified that 1211 E. Cota Street is not included on the Potential Historic Resources List until it is further evaluated.

Commissioner comments:

- 1. Commissioner Shallanberger explained for the benefit of the public that the purpose of report is to evaluate whether there would be a negative impact to these properties from the proposed project if they were designated as historic resources. He also stated that the new dimensions of the bridge need to be examined, as the project's impact on the neighborhood is unclear.
- 2. Commissioner Mahan recommended a plaque on the bridge with a brief history of what was there before and when the new bridge was erected, so that the historical information is available to the community. Chair Suding agreed that a plaque with the dates of the old and new bridges would be appropriate.
- 3. Commissioner Drury questioned why this project is being done and the term in the report "functionally obsolete."
 - Mr. Conti clarified that "functionally obsolete" means that the bridge's approach geometry is significantly different than the bridge itself, thereby creating a safety hazard. It is also close to being structurally obsolete.
- 4. Commissioner Murray commented that the removal of trees and potential specimen trees needs to be addressed in the report.
- 5. Commissioner Orías stated that this is an area where flooding is a reality. Improvements to bridges are important to residents.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comment:

1. Provide a preliminary plan of the new bridge showing the extent and impact of it to the neighborhood and an overlay indicating the existing significant vegetation in excess of six inches, in the form of an appendix to the current report.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Winick absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

2. CITYWIDE

(1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 099-MSC-0PD
Application Number: MST2015-00518
Applicant: City of Santa Barbara

Business Name: Citywide Wayfinding Sign Program

(Proposal for a Citywide Wayfinding Signage Program consisting of one unified sign design for El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, the Waterfront District, and the City at large. The purpose of the project is to serve as a framework to implement a unified signage system throughout the City that establishes design consistency for vehicles, pedestrians, bicycles, and parking.)

(Concept review; comments only. Project requires Sign Committee review.)

Actual time: 2:19 p.m.

Present: Browning Allen, Transportation Manager, City of Santa Barbara; Jennifer Bressler, Hunt

Design; and Chris Helm, Hunt Design

Public comment opened at 2:32 p.m.

- 1. Brian Bosse, Business Manager of the Waterfront Department of the City of Santa Barbara, voiced support for the proposed program.
- 2. Matt LaBrie, of the Downtown Organization and Downtown Parking Committee, stated that the Parking Committee is supportive of the plan and considers it well done.
- 3. Kellam de Forest stated that the new signage is useful, but he had concerns about signage font size, color, and sign shape.

Public comment closed at 2:36 p.m.

<u>Staff comments</u>: Mr. Limón stated that there has been a great deal of input from several boards about this project and that a lot of the design work was completed; any design changes passed on to the Sign Committee by the HLC will need to be based on specific concerns.

** The Commission recessed from 2:38 p.m. to 2:50 p.m. to check the proposed signage in the sunlight. **

Motion: Continued to the Sign Committee as submitted with positive comments:

- 1. Study reducing the size of the pedestrian sign.
- 2. Study the proportions of the ogees.

Action: Shallanberger/La Voie, 8/0/0. (Winick absent.) Motion carried.

** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:20 P.M. TO 3:26 P.M. **

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

3. 1200 BLK QUINIENTOS ST 1373 SEG ID

(2:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-373
Application Number: MST2014-00387
Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Landscape Architect: David Black & Associates

(Proposal to replace the Quinientos Street Bridge over Sycamore Creek. The existing single span bridge is approximately 36 feet long and 38 feet wide and was constructed in 1930. A new single span concrete bridge will be designed to meet the required standards of the City, Caltrans, and the American Association of State Highway and Transportation officials [AASHTO].)

(Review of an Archeological Survey Report and Memorandum prepared by Applied Earthworks, Inc.)

Actual time: 3:26 p.m.

Present: Colleen Hamilton, Architectural Historian, Applied Earthworks; and Tom Conti, Design

Engineer, Applied Earthworks

<u>Staff comments</u>: Ms. Kaufman stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological survey report and the memorandum pertaining to the above-mentioned property. He concluded that the archaeological investigation reported in these two documents supports their conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 3:26 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 8/0/0. (Winick absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

4. 220 W GUTIERREZ ST C-2 Zone

(3:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-202-006

Application Number: MST2015-00047 Owner: Betty Goldberg

Architect: AB Design Studio, Inc.

(This project involves two adjacent parcels: 037-202-005 at 223 Cottage Grove Ave. and 037-202-006 at 220 W. Gutierrez St. The proposed work on the first parcel includes demolishing 968 square feet of open storage area, restriping the parking lot, and adding new parking lot perimeter landscape planters. The proposed work on the second parcel includes the partial demolition of 1,078 square feet [under building permit application BLD2014-02591] and the construction of 1,898 square feet of floor area, resulting in a net increase of 820 square feet of new non-residential square footage. This project will result in a total development of 5,008 square feet over two parcels, totaling 9,450 square feet in size.)

(Review of a Phase I Archeological Resources Report prepared by Rincon Consultants.)

Actual time: 3:27 p.m.

Present: Christopher Duran, Rincon Cultural Resources Project Manager/Principal Investigator,

Rincon Consultants

<u>Staff comments:</u> Ms. Kaufman stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the above-mentioned property. He concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations. Specifically, he agreed that an archaeologist should monitor any construction activities entailing earth-moving. Incidentally, he noted an incomplete sentence at the end of the first paragraph of section 5.1.3 on page 11.

Public comment opened at 3:29 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

<u>Commissioner comments</u>: Commissioner La Voie asked how the incomplete sentence in section 5.1.3, page 11, pointed out by Dr. Glassow, should be revised. The sentence should read, "Adherence to these mitigation measures is required." Additionally, in section 5.1.4, page 11, the title heading should read, "Unanticipated Discovery of Human Remains."

Motion: To accept the report as amended.

Action: Shallanberger/Orías, 8/0/0. (Winick absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

5. 209 STATE ST HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(3:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-042-012

Application Number: MST2015-00193 Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: Brian D'Amour, Public Works

(On behalf of the Neighborhood Improvement Task Force [NITF], the project proposes to install the brick bench sculpture titled "Crescent Crossing" by Donald Davis onto the existing lawn at the railroad depot with a hardscape surround. This project is adjacent to the designated City Landmark: Southern Pacific Railroad Station.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on May 20, 2015.)

Actual time: 4:14 p.m.

Present: Brian D'Amour, Principal Engineer, City of Santa Barbara; and Jaime Limón, Design

Review Supervisor, City of Santa Barbara

<u>Staff comments</u>: Mr. Limón stated that the comments of the HLC at the May 20, 2015 meeting were reviewed, and they do not match the denial motion entered into the record. He asked that the Chair reopen the motion of that meeting to clarify it.

Chair Suding re-opened the minutes of the HLC Full Commission meeting of May 20, 2015.

Motion: Clarify the wording of the prior motion by striking the word "denied" and replacing

with "unacceptable."

Action: La Voie/Murray, 8/0/0. (Winick absent.)

Public comment opened at 4:27 p.m.

- 1. Matt LaBrie, of the Downtown Parking Committee, voiced support for the relocation to the proposed site.
- 2. Kellam de Forest expressed concern about the proposed location and suggested alternate locations.
- 3. Robert Adams, landscape architect and Chair of the Arts Advisory Committee, supported the relocation to the railroad station.
- 4. Alexandra Cole is very concerned about the proposed lawn location and its impacts to the historic resource. She proposed putting the bench in the alternative, concrete area.
- 5. Ginny Brush, of the City Arts Advisory Committee, the Santa Barbara County Arts Commission, and the Visual Art in Public Places Committee, thanked Alexandra Cole for meeting with her to discuss the historical significance of the railroad depot. She supports relocation to the alternative railroad station location.
- 6. Mary Heebner, part of the Visual Art in Public Places Committee (VAPP) and a working artist, expressed appreciation for Alexandra Cole's description of the historic aspects of the lawn and supports the new location.

7. Wendy Wilton Davis, the widow of Donald Davis, is concerned about the development of the waterfront. She stated that train stations see a lot of activity and questioned why the same problem would not arise in the new location.

E-mailed comments of support from Jacqueline Dyson, Nina Dunbar, Judy Nilsen, and Rita Ferri were included in the Commissioners' packets but were not acknowledged at the meeting.

Public comment closed at 4:38 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with condition:

1. Move the sculpture to the railroad depot, not to the lawn location proposed, but to the alternative location west of depot, identified as the "Bus Loading Area"; return with a specific site plan.

Action: Mahan/Orías, 8/0/0. (Winick absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

6. 600 BLK STATE ST 1828 SEG ID

(3:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-828 Application Number: MST2015-00192

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: Brian D'Amour, Public Works

(This is a revised project description. On behalf of the Neighborhood Improvement Task Force [NITF], the project proposes to remove and relocate the existing brick bench sculpture "Crescent Crossing" by Donald Davis from the sidewalk right of way fronting 628 State St. The curb, gutter, and brick sidewalk will be repaired to match the existing. The foundation for a public art piece and a bicycle post will be installed at this location. The relocation of the public art piece is being reviewed under a separate application [MST2015-00193].)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on May 20, 2015.)

** THE FOLLOWING AGENDA ITEM WAS REVIEWED OUT OF ORDER. **

Actual time: 3:32 p.m.

Present: Brian D'Amour, Principal Engineer, City of Santa Barbara; and Jaime Limón, Design

Review Supervisor, City of Santa Barbara

<u>Staff comments</u>: Mr. Limón stated that the comments of the HLC at the May 20, 2015 meeting were reviewed, and they do not match the denial motion entered into the record. He asked that the Chair reopen the motion of that meeting to clarify it.

Chair Suding re-opened the minutes of the HLC Full Commission meeting of May 20, 2015.

Motion: Clarify the wording of the prior motion by striking the word "denied" and replacing

with "unacceptable."

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Winick absent.) Motion carried.

Public comment opened at 3:41 p.m.

- 1. Blake Rankin was an apprentice of Donald Davis. He expressed opposition to the public art piece removal and stated the issue was related to the maintenance of the adjacent business.
- 2. Wendy Wilton Davis, the widow of Mr. Davis, feels strongly that the artwork should not be moved. She stated that it sets a very bad precedent to move art when the problem is the surroundings, not the art.
- 3. Ginny Brush, of the City Arts Advisory Committee, the Santa Barbara County Arts Commission, and the Visual Art in Public Places Committee, stated that she supports the bench removal.
- 4. Mary Heebner is part of the Visual Art in Public Places Committee (VAPP) and a working artist. She feels that the current site is well suited for the art piece but finds the relocation site appropriate.
- 5. Ken Oplinger, of the Santa Barbara Chamber of Commerce, supports the art piece relocation in this unique situation.
- 6. Maggie Campbell, of the Downtown Organization, expressed appreciation for the comments from the art community. She supports the bench removal and relocation due to the impact to surrounding businesses.

Public comment closed at 3:56 p.m.

Staff comments:

- 1. Sergeant Riley Harwood, of the City of Santa Barbara Police Department, is in charge of community and media relations. His officers have been involved in the issues surrounding the artwork. He stated that the sculpture is one element of environmental design in the area that contributes to nuisance crimes. A pedestrian choke point has been created that slows pedestrian traffic and makes it an ideal location for low-level public harassment. He cited statistics showing a steady increase in police calls to the art bench area. Sergeant Harwood stated that there is a correlation between denial of access to the artwork and a significant reduction in calls for police service. The calls, though mostly for minor crimes or inappropriate behavior, have an impact on quality of life for visitors and businesses.
- 2. Marck Aguilar, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara, has been involved in the project since the beginning and had many conversations with Mr. Davis. Over time, Mr. Aguilar stated, Mr. Davis felt it was time to move the art. Mr. Aguilar met with Mr. Davis last December and took him to the proposed relocation site. Mr. Aguilar stated that Mr. Davis felt that the piece was no longer benefitting the community at its current location, and that he liked the depot location.

Commissioner comments:

1. Commissioner La Voie stated that he was involved in the discussion about placing the artwork in its current location. He was skeptical at the time about how it would fit into El Pueblo Viejo but was intrigued by the artist's vision and the idea of its use as a bench and a landmark on State Street. It functioned for years very successfully before suddenly becoming a gathering spot for what has been called the wrong sort of people. Commissioner La Voie emphasized that is the problem, not the sculpture. He proposed a mobile police station as a solution until the nuisance leaves. He expressed that the City should wait out the situation instead of removing art designed for this specific location.

- 2. Commissioner Orías stated that relocating art is not uncommon. She is concerned about the effects that the problems surrounding the art have on merchants and tourists, who are the backbone of the community. She expressed that if the piece is a detrimental attraction, it should be moved.
- 3. Chair Suding mentioned that Mr. Davis came to his office to discuss the sculpture. After hearing Ginny Brush and others from the art community express that it should be moved, and hearing that it was also Mr. Davis' wish, Chair Suding agrees.

Public comment re-opened at 4:12 p.m.

Wendy Wilton Davis is the widow of Mr. Davis and wished to represent her husband's voice. When the problems around the piece surfaced, her husband was very sick. She stated that Mr. Davis didn't seem to know what he wanted to happen to the sculpture and that he was upset at the initial idea of relocation and the precedent it would set. Her understanding is that an artist's work cannot just be moved. She emphasized that the City has a problem with the people misusing the artwork, not the artwork itself. She would consider the piece being gifted to Cate School.

Public comment closed at 4:13 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted.

Action: Mahan/Orías, 7/1/0. (La Voie opposed/Winick absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:52 P.M. TO 4:59 P.M. **

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

7. 2559 PUESTA DEL SOL E-1 Zone

(4:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-271-003

Application Number: MST2015-00511

Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History
Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services

Engineer: Flowers & Associates

(Phase 1 of the Master Plan build-out for the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History. This includes compliance requirements for installation of a soundwall, demo/remodel of the Western Residence, and Puesta del Sol pedestrian and right-of-way improvements. It also includes replacement of the Butterfly Pavilion, pedestrian access and ADA improvements, trash & recycle enclosure additions, new fencing, bioswale & native habitat restoration, landscaping and wayfinding signage enhancements, mechanical equipment replacement, and interior repairs to existing buildings.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:59 p.m.

Present:

Suzanne Elledge, Agent, Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services (SEPPS); Heidi Jones, SEPPS; Walter Schacht, Architect, Schacht Aslani Architects; Dylan Johnson, Schacht Aslani Architects; Susan Van Atta, Landscape Architect, Van Atta Associates; Luke Swetland, President & CEO, Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History; and Pamela Post, Historian, Post/Hazeltine Associates

<u>Staff comments</u>: Dan Gullett, Project Planner, stated that the amended conditional use permit was approved by the City Council in March 2015, and that there would be various components of the project coming to the HLC over time. Mr. Gullett explained that there were design review conditions included in the permit. The only one related to what the HLC would see today was about the trash enclosure; it requires minimum capacity for recycling containers and screening from view from surrounding properties.

Public comment opened at 5:23 p.m.

- 1. Kellam de Forest commended the museum on the steps it is taking and hopes the project can be approved to move forward with construction.
- 2. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Lauren Carey.
- 3. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Paulina Conn.

Public comment closed at 5:25 p.m.

Straw Vote: How many Commissioners can support the shape of the butterfly enclosure as proposed? 5/7 (Passed)

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

- 1. The Commission supports the shape of the butterfly enclosure.
- 2. The Commission supports the natural elements of the plan and does not support the mixing of natural and manufactured stone; the stone arch should have keystones over the rounded top.
- 3. Restudy the railing and the treehouse portion of the boardwalk geometry separating it from the cottage.
- 4. The gate to the trash enclosure needs restudy.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger and Winick absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

8. 329 E CANON PERDIDO ST C-2 Zone

(4:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-301-048

Application Number: MST2015-00483 Owner: Kenneth Olsen Architect: John Beauchamp

(Proposal for the demolition of an existing 683 square foot single-family residence, and the construction of a new three-story 2,167 square foot single-family residence. No parking spaces exist onsite, and two parking spaces are required. An attached 576 square foot two-car garage is proposed on the ground level to back out into Canon Perdido St. The total of 2,167 square feet of development is 99% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. This project addresses violations in enforcement case ENF2015-00115 and Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00023. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for front setback, two interior setbacks, and open yard modifications.)

(Concept review; comments only. Project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for requested front and interior setback and open yard modifications.)

Actual time: 5:50 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Vanguard Planning; and John Beauchamp, Architect, Eleven Modern

Public comment opened at 6:08 p.m.

- 1. Sally Terrell, a neighbor, expressed concern about the scale and height of the project and impacts to her view.
- 2. Wendy Foster, a neighbor, remarked that no properties in the neighborhood are set next to each other so closely and that the proposed structure is excessive for the property size.
- 3. Hugh Dow, a neighbor, is supportive of the project, stating that it will increase his property value.
- 4. Kevin Finnegan, a neighbor, thanked the HLC for its dedication and expressed support for the project as an improvement to the currently neglected property and area safety.
- 5. Kellam de Forest wondered when the little house was built. He also wished to know the height, as he considers it too tall for the site. He stated that it impacts El Caserio, a City landmark that needs to be respected.
- 6. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Sarah Hall.
- 7. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of support from Eileen Finnegan.

Public comment closed at 6:17 p.m.

Public comment re-opened at 6:23 p.m.

Hugh Dow stated, for reference, that the front of his building is 16 feet high and 24 feet high in the back.

Public comment closed at 6:23 p.m.

Public comment re-opened at 6:31 p.m.

Sally Terrell expressed that part of the charm of her view is the roofline, which may be blocked by the roof of the proposed structure.

Public comment closed at 6:31 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

- 1. The Commission finds the modification supportable, but prior to recommendation to the Staff Hearing Officer, it would like to see a modulation of the size, bulk, scale, with reduction in height, and a finessing of the architecture to be more compatible with the Historic Landmark Commission guidelines.
- 2. Reduce the height of the roof over the living room along with the amount of glass on the south elevation.
- 3. The Commission requests a photo simulation from the building to the west and from El Caserio.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger and Winick absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

9. 25 W COTA

(5:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-171-011

Application Number: MST2015-00330 Owner: TPG Chapala LLC

Applicant: DMHA

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to renovate a historic industrial building for a commercial/office use. The existing building would be converted from light industrial to office use. New second- and third-story additions and a roof deck are proposed. Four new parking spaces are proposed inside the building. A total of 2,909 square feet of non-residential additions are proposed for a total of 12,643 square feet of floor area. There is no existing parking onsite. Four parking spaces are proposed on the lower level. The project requires Development Plan findings for the new nonresidential floor area. This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Hendry Brothers Blacksmith and Welding Shop.")

- a) (Review of a Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra Cole. The report concludes that the project will not have a significant impact on the significant historic resource.)
- b) (Second concept review; comments only. Project requires environmental assessment and development plan findings. Project was last reviewed on July 15, 2015.)

Actual time: 6:35 p.m.

Present: Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian; Ryan Mills, DMHA; and Edward de Vicente,

DMHA

Staff comments:

1. Ms. Hernández stated that staff agrees with the conclusions of the report that the project meets the Secretary of Interior's Standards and CEQA guidelines.

- 2. Ms. Kaufman stated that there is a potential issue with the parking in terms of demolition. If exceeding 50% demolition, the applicant must provide the full extent of the parking, which is approximately 13 spaces. Zoning Staff has determined that the proposal constitutes a demolition. The applicant has decided to move forward at their own risk.
- 3. Ms. Kaufman read in a memo from Chelsey Swanson, Associate Transportation Planner, City of Santa Barbara.

Commissioner comments:

- 1. Commissioner Drury found the report educational and agrees with its conclusions.
- 2. Commissioner Murray expressed that it is a great report.

Public comment opened at 6:37 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Mahan/La Voie, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger and Winick absent.) Motion carried.

Public comment opened at 6:50 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

- 1. The Commission appreciates the proposed design.
- 2. Remove the second gable on the east elevation.

Action: Mahan/Orías, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger and Winick absent.) Motion carried.

** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:55 P.M. **